



NIAGARA CATHOLIC
DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

AGENDA AND MATERIAL

SPECIAL BOARD MEETING

MONDAY, JUNE 22, 2009
5:00 P.M.

FATHER KENNETH BURNS, C.S.C. BOARD ROOM
CATHOLIC EDUCATION CENTRE, WELLAND, ONTARIO

A. ROUTINE MATTERS

1. Opening Prayer -
2. Roll Call -
3. Approval of the Agenda -
4. Declaration of Conflict of Interest -

B. COMMITTEE AND STAFF REPORTS

1. St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary Schools (Grimsby)
Replacement Elementary School Facilities - Award of Construction Contract B1

C. ADJOURNMENT

**TO: NIAGARA CATHOLIC DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD
SPECIAL BOARD MEETING
PUBLIC SESSION
JUNE 22, 2009**

**TOPIC: ST. JOSEPH & OUR LADY OF FATIMA CATHOLIC
ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS (GRIMSBY)
REPLACEMENT ELEMENTARY SCHOOL FACILITIES
AWARD OF CONSTRUCTION CONTRACT**

RECOMMENDATION

THAT the Niagara Catholic District School Board approve the award of a construction contract to Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd, for the replacement of St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary School facilities, subject to Ministry approval, and

THAT the Niagara Catholic District School Board approve the project budget of \$13,478,609.00, for the replacement of St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary School facilities, subject to Ministry approval, and

THAT the Niagara Catholic District School Board approve the funding of the projects as outlined in the report, including the transfer of up to \$838,073.00 from the Reserve for Working Funds for the replacement of St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary School facilities, subject to Ministry approval.

Prepared by: James Woods, Controller of Plant

Presented by: James Woods, Controller of Plant

Approved by: John Crocco, Director of Education

Date: June 22, 2009



NIAGARA CATHOLIC
DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

**REPORT TO THE SPECIAL BOARD MEETING
JUNE 22, 2009**

**ST. JOSEPH AND OUR LADY OF FATIMA
CATHOLIC ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS (GRIMSBY)
REPLACEMENT ELEMENTARY SCHOOL FACILITIES
AWARD OF CONSTRUCTION CONTRACT**

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

Tenders were opened on Friday June 19th, 2009 for the replacement Our Lady of Fatima (OLF) and St. Joseph (SJ) Catholic Elementary School facilities, as per the drawings and specifications prepared by Venerino V. P. Panici Architect Inc.

Individual tenders were received for Our Lady of Fatima, St. Joseph, and a combined price on Tuesday June 16th, Thursday June 18th and Friday June 19th, 2009 respectively, but not opened. All sealed tenders were opened together, in public, on Friday June 19th, 2009.

The results of the tender were as follows:

	CONTRACTOR	OLF BID PRICE	SJ BID PRICE	COMBINED BID PRICE
1.	Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd.	\$5,854,000	\$5,226,000	\$10,928,600
2.	Charter Building Company	\$6,082,319	\$5,287,489	\$11,379,803
3.	T. R. Hinan Contractors	\$6,100,000	\$5,332,000	\$11,382,000
4.	Merit Contractors Niagara	\$6,209,000	\$5,281,000	\$11,490,000
5.	Reid & Deleye Contractors Ltd.	\$6,115,169	\$5,415,773	\$11,530,942
6.	Kenmore Management Inc.	\$6,233,000	\$5,444,123	\$11,642,000

TOTAL PROJECT COST

The Architects have analyzed the bids and have recommended the award of a construction contract for the two projects to Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd. (Appendix B). The total cost for the combined projects would be as follows:

	ST. JOSEPH	OUR LADY OF FATIMA	TOTAL
Construction Contract	\$ 5,092,000	\$ 5,836,600	\$ 10,928,600
GST, after rebate	\$ 81,472	\$ 93,386	\$ 174,858
Consultant Fees & Disbursements	\$ 441,300	\$ 489,000	\$ 930,300
Salvage & Asbestos Removal	\$ 66,860	\$ 126,800	\$ 193,660
Inspection and Testing	\$ 9,000	\$ 9,000	\$ 18,000
Permits	\$ 36,865	\$ 42,526	\$ 79,391
CATV & Data Cabling	\$ 54,000	\$ 70,200	\$ 124,200
Security & Card Access	\$ 43,000	\$ 44,000	\$ 87,000
Telephone and PA	\$ 30,000	\$ 34,000	\$ 64,000
Furniture & Equipment	\$ 94,200	\$ 139,300	\$ 233,500
Moving	\$ 11,000	\$ 13,000	\$ 24,000
Cleaning & Finishing	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000	\$ 30,000
Portable Removal and Relocation	\$ 30,400	\$ 60,700	\$ 91,100
Contingency	\$ 300,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 500,000
	\$ 6,305,097	\$ 7,173,512	\$ 13,478,609

FUNDING

Funding for the project would be from the following sources:

	ST. JOSEPH	OUR LADY OF FATIMA	TOTAL
Ministry Planning Approval per Milestone 1	\$ 5,687,092	\$ 6,387,092	\$ 12,074,184
Facilities Renewal 2008-2009 to cover salvage & asbestos removal	\$ 66,860	\$ 126,800	\$ 193,660
Facilities Renewal 2008-2009 to cover portable removal and relocation	\$ 30,400	\$ 60,700	\$ 91,100
Facilities Renewal 2009-2010 to cover data, security & communications cabling and equipment	\$ 139,200	\$ 160,400	\$ 299,600
Reserve for Working Funds	\$ 381,545	\$ 438,528	\$ 838,073
	\$ 6,305,097	\$ 7,173,520	\$ 13,478,609

MINISTRY OF EDUCATION APPROVAL

Subsequent to the funding approval under the Prohibitive to Repair program for the replacement of St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary Schools, the Ministry developed a planning and reporting tool detailing three milestones. After completing the tendering process (Milestone 2), the Board must report the results and receive Ministry approval before awarding a construction contract. The required report (Appendix A) has been forwarded to the Ministry by Senior Staff on June 22, 2009.

ATTACHMENTS

Appendix A: Letter to Ministry of Education re: Prohibitive to Repair Program, Milestone 2
Appendix B: Tender Analysis and Recommendation, June 19, 2009
Venerino V. P. Panici Architect Inc.

RECOMMENDATION

THAT the Niagara Catholic District School Board approve the award of a construction contract to Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd., for the replacement of St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary School (Grimsby) facilities, subject to Ministry approval, and

THAT the Niagara Catholic District School Board approve the project budget of \$13,478,609.00, for the replacement of St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary School (Grimsby) facilities, subject to Ministry approval, and

THAT the Niagara Catholic District School Board approve the funding of the projects as outlined in the report, including the transfer of up to \$838,073.00 from the Reserve for Working Funds for the replacement of St. Joseph and Our Lady of Fatima Catholic Elementary School (**Grimsby**) facilities, subject to Ministry approval.

Prepared by: James Woods, Controller of Plant
Presented by: James Woods, Controller of Plant
Approved by: John Crocco, Director of Education
Date: June 22, 2009



NIAGARA CATHOLIC
DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD

June 22, 2009

Capital Programs Branch
Ministry of Education
900 Bay Street, Mowat Block, 21st Floor
Toronto, ON
M7A 1L2

Attn: Cameron Whitehead

Dear Mr. Whitehead,

Re: Prohibitive to Repair Program, Milestone 2

Tenders were opened on Friday June 19th, 2009 for the replacement Our Lady of Fatima (OLF) and St. Joseph (SJ) Catholic Elementary School facilities, as per the drawings and specifications prepared by Venerino V. P. Panici Architect Inc.
The results of the tender were as follows:

CONTRACTOR	OLF BID PRICE	SJ BID PRICE	COMBINED BID PRICE
1. Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd.	\$5,854,000	\$5,226,000	\$10,928,600
2. Charter Building Company	\$6,082,319	\$5,287,489	\$11,379,803
3. T. R. Hinan Contractors	\$6,100,000	\$5,332,000	\$11,382,000
4. Merit Contractors Niagara	\$6,209,000	\$5,281,000	\$11,490,000
5. Reid & Deleye Contractors Ltd.	\$6,115,169	\$5,415,773	\$11,530,942
6. Kenmore Management Inc.	\$6,233,000	\$5,444,123	\$11,642,000

TOTAL PROJECT COST

The Architects have analyzed the bids and have recommended the award of a construction contract for the two projects to Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd. (Appendix B). The total cost for the combined projects would be as follows:

	OUR LADY		
	ST. JOSEPH	OF FATIMA	TOTAL
Construction Contract	\$ 5,092,000	\$ 5,836,600	\$ 10,928,600
GST, after rebate	\$ 81,472	\$ 93,386	\$ 174,858
Consultant Fees & Disbursements	\$ 441,300	\$ 489,000	\$ 930,300
Salvage & Asbestos Removal	\$ 66,860	\$ 126,800	\$ 193,660
Inspection and Testing	\$ 9,000	\$ 9,000	\$ 18,000
Permits	\$ 36,865	\$ 42,526	\$ 79,391
CATV & Data Cabling	\$ 54,000	\$ 70,200	\$ 124,200
Security & Card Access	\$ 43,000	\$ 44,000	\$ 87,000
Telephone and PA	\$ 30,000	\$ 34,000	\$ 64,000
Furniture & Equipment	\$ 94,200	\$ 139,300	\$ 233,500
Moving	\$ 11,000	\$ 13,000	\$ 24,000
Cleaning & Finishing	\$ 15,000	\$ 15,000	\$ 30,000
Portable Removal and Relocation	\$ 30,400	\$ 60,700	\$ 91,100
Contingency	\$ 300,000	\$ 200,000	\$ 500,000
	\$ 6,305,097	\$ 7,173,512	\$ 13,478,609

FUNDING:

Funding for the project would be from the following sources:

	ST.	OUR LADY	TOTAL
	JOSEPH	OF FATIMA	
Ministry Planning Approval per Milestone 1	\$ 5,687,092	\$ 6,387,092	\$ 12,074,184
Facilities Renewal 2008-2009 to cover salvage & asbestos removal	\$ 66,860	\$ 126,800	\$ 193,660
Facilities Renewal 2008-2009 to cover portable removal and relocation	\$ 30,400	\$ 60,700	\$ 91,100
Facilities Renewal 2009-2010 to cover data, security & communications cabling and equipment	\$ 139,200	\$ 160,400	\$ 299,600
Reserve for Working Funds	\$ 381,545	\$ 438,528	\$ 838,073
	\$ 6,305,097	\$ 7,173,520	\$ 13,478,609

At a special Board meeting this evening, Niagara Catholic District School Board staff will recommend the award of construction contracts to Brouwer Construction for the two schools, subject to approval by the Ministry.

If any further information is required please contact me at (905) 735-0240 X 230, or Kathy Levinski at (905) 735-0240 X 273.

Yours truly,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "J Woods".

James Woods,
Controller of Plant

cc: John Crocco
Ron Ciarlo
Tony Ferrara
Kathy Levinski



VENERINO V.P. PANICI
ARCHITECT
 I N C

Venerino V.P. Panici Architect Inc.

146 James Street, P.O. Box 386
 St. Catharines, Ontario L2R 6T7
 Tel. (905) 688-6087
 Fax. (905) 688-1778

June 22, 2009

Niagara Catholic District School Board
 427 Rice Road
 Welland, ON L3C 7C1

**Attention: Mr. James Woods, B. ARCH, MBA, OAA, MRAIC
 Controller of Plant Services**

**Re: Tender Analysis, Project Costs Summary for the Tender of
 The New Our Lady of Fatima and St. Joseph Catholic
 Elementary Schools, Grimsby, Ontario**

Dear Mr. Woods,

The following is a summary of the tendering for the New Our Lady of Fatima and St. Joseph Catholic Elementary Schools.

1. Seven General Contractors, Nine Mechanical SubContractors, Ten Electrical Sub Contractors and Four Masonry SubContractors were Prequalified by the Niagara Catholic District School Board.
2. Six Prequalified General Contractors picked-up drawings and specifications from the office of the Architect.
3. Drawings and Specifications were on display at the Hamilton-Halton and Niagara Construction Associations for sub-trade take-off.
4. Pre-Tender site meetings were held June 08, 2009 at the Schools. Six of the seven prequalified General Contractors attended along with a number of Mechanical and Electrical Sub-Contractors. The urgency of organization and construction timing was stressed as well as the St. Joseph Soil Conditions.
5. The Tenders closed June 19, 2009 at 3:00 pm and were publicly opened at 3:15 pm at the Board's office.
6. The following are the **combined** tenders received from the low to the high, base bid only and excluding G.S.T.

i)	Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd.	\$ 10,928,600.00
ii)	Charter Building Company	\$ 11,379,803.00
iv)	T. R. Hinan Contractors	\$ 11,382,000.00
v)	Merit Contractors Niagara	\$ 11,490,000.00



vi)	Reid & Deleye Contractors Ltd.	\$ 11,530,942.00
vii)	Kenmore Management Inc.	\$ 11,642,000.00
viii)	Martin-Stewart Contracting Ltd.	Formally Declined to Bid (June 08, 2009)

Tender Information Forms are attached. They include the following :

Chart 'A'	The New Our Lady of Fatima Tender Results
Chart 'B'	The New St. Joseph Tender Results
Chart 'C'	The Combined Tender Results for both Our Lady of Fatima and St. Joseph
Chart 'D'	The New Our Lady of Fatima Voluntary Alternates and Separate Prices
Chart 'E'	The New St. Joseph Voluntary Alternates and Separate Prices
Chart 'F'	The New St. Joseph Unit Prices for Excavation and Backfill
Chart 'G'	Summary of Combined Tender Prices showing a Final Contract Cost. This Final Contract Cost does not reflect Charts 'D' and 'E', which will be reviewed at a later date. The selection of credits will be reflected in the form of a Change Order.

Based on our review of the above, we recommend the award of both Our Lady of Fatima and St. Joseph Catholic Elementary Schools to Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd. of St. Catharines.

This office has worked with Brouwer Construction (1981) Ltd.. on many various Projects, including Institutional, Municipal and High Rise Residential and have found them to be professional, organized and co-operative, both in the office and field, bringing the projects to a successful completions.

Yours very truly,

Venerino V.P. Panici, Architect
VENERINO V. P. PANICI ARCHITECT INC

VVPP/bbb/jr
Enclosure